Large carbon cycle sensitivities to climate across a permafrost thaw gradient in subarctic Sweden

Kuang-Yu Chang*,
Climate and Ecosystem Sciences Division, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory,
Berkeley, California, USA

William J. Riley,
Climate and Ecosystem Sciences Division, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory,
Berkeley, California, USA

Patrick Crill,
Department of Geological Sciences, Stockholm University, Stockholm, Sweden

Robert F. Grant,
Department of Renewable Resources, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada

Virginia Rich,
Department of Microbiology, The Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio, USA

and,

Scott Saleska,
Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of Arizona, Tucson,
Arizona, USA

*Corresponding author: Kuang-Yu Chang, ckychang@lbl.gov
Climate and Ecosystem Sciences Division, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory
Berkeley, California, USA
25 Phone: (510) 495-8141
Abstract

Permafrost peatlands store large amounts of carbon potentially vulnerable to decomposition. However, the fate of that carbon in a changing climate remains uncertain in models due to complex interactions among hydrological, biogeochemical, microbial, and plant processes. In this study, we estimated effects of climate forcing biases present in global climate reanalysis products on carbon cycle predictions at a thawing permafrost peatland in subarctic Sweden. The analysis was conducted with a comprehensive biogeochemical model (ecosys) across a permafrost thaw gradient encompassing intact palsa with an ice core and a shallow active layer, partly thawed bog with a deeper active layer and a variable water table, and fully thawed fen with a water table close to the surface, each with distinct vegetation and microbiota. Using in situ observations to correct local cold and wet biases found in the Global Soil Wetness Project Phase 3 (GSWP3) climate reanalysis forcing, we evaluated our model performance by comparing predicted and observed carbon dioxide (CO₂) and methane (CH₄) exchanges, thaw depth, and water table depth. The simulations driven by the bias-corrected climate suggest that the three peatland types currently accumulate carbon from the atmosphere, although the bog and fen sites can have annual positive radiative forcing impacts due to their higher CH₄ emissions. Our simulations indicate that projected precipitation increases could accelerate CH₄ emissions from the palsa area, even without further degradation of palsa permafrost. The GSWP3 cold and wet biases for this site significantly alter simulation results and lead to erroneous active layer depth and carbon budget estimates. Biases in simulated CO₂ and CH₄ exchanges from biased climate forcing are as large as those among the thaw stages themselves at a landscape scale across the examined permafrost
thaw gradient. Future studies should thus not only focus on changes in carbon budget associated with morphological changes in thawing permafrost, but also recognize the effects of climate forcing uncertainty on carbon cycling.
1. Introduction

Confidence in future climate projections depends on the accuracy of terrestrial carbon budget estimates, which are presently very uncertain (Friedlingstein et al., 2014; Arneth et al., 2017). In addition to the complexity in physical process representations, a major source of this uncertainty comes from challenges in quantifying climate responses induced by biogeochemical feedbacks. Increases in atmospheric carbon dioxide (CO₂) concentrations can directly stimulate carbon sequestration from plant photosynthesis (Cox et al., 2000; Friedlingstein et al., 2006) and indirectly stimulate carbon emissions (e.g., from soil warming and resulting increased respiration), although the predicted magnitudes of these exchanges strongly depend on model process representations (Zaehle et al., 2010; Grant, 2013, 2014; Ghimire et al., 2016; Chang et al, 2018).

The undecomposed carbon stored in permafrost is of critical importance for biogeochemical feedbacks to climate because it is about twice as much as currently is in the atmosphere (Hugelius et al., 2014) and is vulnerable to release to the atmosphere as permafrost thaws (Schuur et al., 2015). Lundin et al. (2016) reported that it is plausible (71% probability) for the high latitude terrestrial landscape to serve as a net carbon source to the atmosphere, although its peatland components would remain atmospheric carbon sinks.

In addition to the overall carbon balance of the changing Arctic, the type of carbon gaseous emission is important to climate feedbacks. High latitudes are predicted to get wetter (IPCC, 2014), and saturated anaerobic conditions facilitate methane (CH₄) production, which is a much more efficient greenhouse gas than CO₂ in terms of global warming potential. Even habitats that can be net carbon sinks can produce positive
radiative forcing impacts on climate due to CH$_4$ release, as Bäckstrand et al. (2010) showed for a subarctic peatland. Under projected warming and wetting trends in the Arctic (Collins et al., 2013; Bintanja and Andry, 2017), carbon cycle feedbacks over the permafrost region could become stronger as increased precipitation enhances surface permafrost thaw and strengthens CH$_4$ emissions by expansion of anaerobic volume (Christensen et al., 2004; Wickland et al., 2006).

The Stordalen Mire in northern Sweden (68.20°N, 19.05°E) is in the discontinuous permafrost zone, encompassing a mosaic of thaw stages with associated distinct hydrology and vegetation (Christensen et al. 2004; Malmer et al., 2005), microbiota (Mondav and Woodcroft et al., 2014; Mondav et al., 2017; Woodcroft and Singleton et al., 2018), and organic matter chemistry (Hodgkins et al., 2014). These landscapes have been shifting over the last half-century to a more thawed state, likely due to recent warming (Christensen et al. 2004). Drier hummock sites dominated by shrubs have degraded to wetter sites dominated by graminoids (Malmer et al., 2005; Johansson et al., 2006). The thaw-induced habitat shifts are associated with increases in landscape scale CH$_4$ emissions (Christensen et al. 2004; Johansson et al., 2006; Cooper et al., 2017) reflective of the higher CH$_4$ emissions of the wetter thawed habitats (McCalley et al., 2014). The higher CO$_2$ uptake in later thaw-stage habitats has not compensated for the increase in positive radiative forcing from elevated CH$_4$ emissions (Bäckstrand et al., 2010; Deng et al., 2014).

The impacts of climate sensitivity on the terrestrial carbon cycle have been investigated at the global scale, and the results highlight the need to consider uncertainty in climate datasets when evaluating permafrost region carbon cycle simulations.
Ahlström et al. (2017; Guo et al., 2017; Wu et al., 2017). Ahlström et al. (2017) showed that climate forcing biases are responsible for a considerable fraction (~40%) of the uncertainty range in ecosystem carbon predictions from 18 Earth System Models (ESMs) reported by Anav et al. (2013). Guo et al. (2017) concluded that the differences in climate forcing contribute to significant differences in simulated soil temperature, permafrost area, and active layer thickness. Wu et al. (2017) demonstrated that differences among climate forcing datasets contribute more to predictive uncertainty than differences in apparent model sensitivity to climate forcing. However, notably, none of these studies accessed the effects on CH$_4$ emissions, and their spatial resolution could not represent site-level spatial heterogeneity observed in arctic tundra (Grant et al. 2017a; 2017b).

Here, we use the ecosystem model ecosys, which employs a comprehensive set of fully coupled biogeochemical and hydrological processes, to estimate the effects of climate forcing uncertainty and sensitivity on CO$_2$ and CH$_4$ exchanges and active layer thickness simulations. For the Stordalen Mire site, we estimated bias in the Global Soil Wetness Project Phase 3 (GSWP3) climate reanalysis dataset using site-level long-term meteorological measurements and evaluated impacts on simulated soil and plant processes across the permafrost thaw gradient. This approach enables us to assess model sensitivity to individual climate forcing biases, instead of the aggregated uncertainty range embedded in climate datasets (e.g., variations of climate conditions represented in different climate datasets) presented in previous studies. We address the following questions for our study site at the Stordalen Mire: (1) What are the biases embedded in the GSWP3 climate reanalysis dataset? (2) How do those biases affect model predictions of active layer depth, CO$_2$ exchanges, and CH$_4$ exchanges? (3) How does climate
sensitivity vary across the stages of permafrost thaw? In addition to improving understanding of permafrost responses to climate, we identify ecosystem carbon prediction uncertainty induced by climate forcing uncertainty in general as the biases found in GSWP3 were consistent with other climate reanalysis datasets during the last decade (section 3).

2. Methods and Data

2.1 Study site description

Our study sites are located at the Stordalen Mire (68.20 °N, 19.03 °E: 351 m above sea level), which is about 10 km southeast of the Abisko Scientific Research Station (ANS) in northern Sweden. Significant changes in climate over this region have been recorded during the last few decades. The annual mean air temperature measured at the ANS has risen by 2.5 °C from 1913 to 2006, where it exceeded the 0 °C threshold (0.6 °C in 2006) for the first time over the past century (Callaghan et al., 2010). The measured annual total precipitation has also increased from 306 mm y⁻¹ (years 1913 to 2009) to 336 mm y⁻¹ (years 1980 to 2009) (Olefeldt and Roulet, 2012), along with increased variability in extreme precipitation (Callaghan et al., 2010). The measured annual maximum snow depth has increased from 59 cm (years 1957 to 1971) to 70 cm (years 1986 to 2000), and the snow cover period with snow depth greater than 20 cm has decreased from 5.8 months (years 1957 to 1971) to 4.9 months (years 1986 to 2000) (Malmer et al., 2005).

The Stordalen Mire can be broadly classified into three peatland types: intact permafrost palsa, partly thawed bog, and fully thawed fen (Hodgkins et al., 2014),
hereafter referred to as palsa, bog, and fen. The spatial distribution of these peatland types in 2000 can be found in Olefeldt and Roulet (2012). The palsa sites are ombrotrophic and raised 0.5 to 2.0 m above their surroundings, with a relatively thin peat layer (0.4 to 0.7 m, Rydén et al., 1980), thinner active layer depth (less than 0.7 m in late summer), and no measurable water table depth (Bäckstrand et al., 2008a; 2008b; Olefeldt and Roulet, 2012). The bog sites are ombrotrophic and are wetter than the palsa sites, with a thicker peat layer (0.5 to ~1 m, Rydén et al., 1980), thicker active layer depth (ALD) (greater than 0.9 m), and water table depth fluctuating from 35 cm to the ground surface (Bäckstrand et al., 2008a; 2008b; Olefeldt and Roulet, 2012). The fen sites have no permafrost and are minerotrophic, receiving a large amount of water from a lake to the east of the mire, with water table depths near or above the ground surface (Bäckstrand et al., 2008a; 2008b; Olefeldt and Roulet, 2012). Differences in hydrology and permafrost conditions create high spatial heterogeneity with different soil moisture, pH, and nutrient conditions that support different plant communities (Bäckstrand et al., 2008a; 2008b). The palsa is dominated by dwarf shrubs with some sedges, feather mosses, and lichens (Malmer et al., 2005; Bäckstrand et al., 2008a; 2008b; Olefeldt and Roulet, 2012). The bog is dominated by Sphagnum spp. mosses with a moderate abundance of sedges (Malmer et al., 2005; Bäckstrand et al., 2008a; 2008b; Olefeldt and Roulet, 2012). The fen sites we studied are dominated by sedges (Bäckstrand et al., 2008a; 2008b).

2.2 Field measurements
Continuous daily meteorological measurements have been recorded at the ANS since 1913, including air temperature, precipitation, wind speed, wind direction, relative humidity, and snow depth. Measurements of solar radiation, longwave radiation, and soil temperature are also available at the ANS since 1982. The soil thaw depth (measured to 90 cm) and water table depth measurements were taken in the three peatland types 3 to 5 times per week from early May to mid-October during 2003 to 2007 (Bäckstrand et al., 2008b).

CO₂ and CH₄ exchanges at the three peatland types were measured with automated chambers during the thawed seasons from 2002 to 2007. Chamber lids were removed in the Fall and replaced in the Spring. Three chambers were in the palsa, three were in the bog, and two were in the fen. Each chamber covered an area of 0.14 m² with a height of 25–45 cm depending on the vegetation and the depth of insertion. Each chamber was closed for 5 minutes every 3 hours to measure CO₂ and total hydrocarbon (THC) exchanges. CH₄ exchanges were manually observed approximately 3 times per week, and these measurements were used to quantify the proportion of CH₄ in the measured THC (Bäckstrand et al., 2008a). The CH₄ exchanges were near zero in the palsa sites (Bäckstrand et al., 2008a; Bäckstrand et al., 2008b; Bäckstrand et al., 2010), so it was not incorporated in our model evaluation. We used the CO₂ and CH₄ exchanges observed at 3-hourly steps when the R² values recorded in the measurements were greater than 0.8 (Tokida et al., 2007), and then calculated the associated daily mean exchanges when there were 8 measurements per day (Table 1). The quality-controlled daily measurements only covered 12.4–33.7% of the daily data points because of the lack of continuous quality-controlled 3-hourly measurements. The data screening was applied to
exclude unreliable measurements and avoid biases from inappropriate gap filling, which is necessary for model evaluations. More detailed descriptions of the CO₂ and CH₄ exchanges measurements can be found in Bäckstrand et al. (2008a).

2.3 GSWP3

GSWP3 is an ongoing modeling activity that provides global gridded meteorological forcing (0.5° x 0.5° resolution) and investigates changes in energy-water-carbon cycles throughout the 20th and 21st centuries. The GSWP3 dataset is based on the 20th Century Reanalysis (Compo et al., 2011), using a spectral nudging dynamical downscaling technique described in Yoshimura and Kanamitsu (2008). A more detailed description of the GSWP can be found in Dirmeyer (2011) and van den Hurk et al. (2016).

In this study, we extracted the meteorological conditions at the Stordalen Mire from 1901 to 2010 from the GSWP3 climate reanalysis dataset. The 3-hourly products of air temperature, precipitation, solar radiation, wind speed, and specific humidity were interpolated to hourly intervals with cubic spline interpolation to serve as the meteorological inputs used in our model.

The GSWP3 dataset was chosen over other existing climate reanalysis datasets for its spatial and temporal resolutions. For example, the Climatic Research Unit (CRU; Harris et al., 2014) dataset provided monthly meteorological forcing at 0.5° x 0.5° resolution; the National Centers for Environmental Prediction (NCEP; Kalnay et al., 1996; Kanamitsu et al., 2002) dataset provided 6-hourly meteorological forcing at T62 Gaussian grid (~1.915° x 1.895° resolution); the CRUNCEP (Viovy, 2018) dataset
provided 6-hourly meteorological forcing at 0.5° x 0.5° resolution; and the European Centre for Medium-Range Weather Forecasts (ECMWF; Berrisford et al., 2011) dataset provided 3-hourly meteorological forcing with 125 km (~1.125°) horizontal resolution.

**2.4 Model description**

*Ecosys* is a comprehensive biogeochemistry model that simulates ecosystem responses to diverse environmental conditions with explicit representations of microbial dynamics and soil carbon, nitrogen, and phosphorus biogeochemistry. The above-ground processes are represented in multi-layer plant interacting canopies, and the below-ground processes are represented in multiple soil layers with multi-phase subsurface reactive transport. *Ecosys* operates at variable time steps (down to seconds) determined by convergence criteria, and it can be applied at patch scale (spatially homogenous one-dimensional) and landscape scale (spatially variable two- or three-dimensional). Detailed descriptions, including inputs, outputs, governing equations, parameters, and references of the *ecosys* model can be found in Grant (2013).

The *ecosys* model has been extensively tested against eddy covariance fluxes and related ecophysiological measurements with a wide range of sites and weather conditions in boreal, temperate, and tropical forests (Grant et al., 2007a; Grant et al., 2007c; Grant et al., 2009a; Grant et al., 2009b; Grant et al., 2009c; Grant et al., 2010), wetlands (Dimitrov et al., 2011; Grant et al., 2012b; Dimitrov et al., 2014; Mezbahuddin et al., 2014), grasslands (Grant and Flanagan, 2007; Grant et al., 2012a), tundra (Grant et al., 2003; Grant et al., 2011b; Grant 2015; Grant et al., 2015), croplands (Grant et al., 2007b; Grant et al., 2011a), and other permafrost-associated habitats (Grant and Roulet, 2002; Grant,
235 2017a; Grant et al., 2017b). All *ecosys* model structures are unchanged from those described in these earlier studies.

237 **2.5 Experimental design**

238 To evaluate the effects of climate on model predictions, we conducted four sets of simulations at each of the three peatland types at the Stordalen Mire from 1901 to 2010.

239 The 110 year simulations were performed to ensure the simulation was equilibrated with local climate (Grant et al. 2017a).

240 The meteorological conditions for all the simulations were based on the hourly data extracted from the GSWP3 climate reanalysis dataset (section 2.3). The monthly mean bias of the GSWP3 for this location was calculated by comparing it to the air temperature and precipitation measured at the ANS, for years 1913 to 2010 (section 3.1).

242 The full series of air temperature and precipitation extracted from GSWP3 were then bias-corrected using the monthly mean bias calculated from 1913 to 2010; we label this model scenario CTRL. Our bias correction was conceptually similar to the one used in Ahlström et al. (2017), where the bias-corrected climate forcing fields were the ESM outputs adjusted by the corresponding bias calculated from observations in a reference period.

242 The simulation results from CTRL should represent the reliability of applying *ecosys* at the Stordalen Mire because CTRL is driven by the best local climate description. We first evaluated predicted thaw depth, water table depth, and CO₂ and CH₄ exchanges using the CTRL simulation (section 3.2 to 3.4). In the second set of simulations, BIASED-COLD, the biased GSWP3 air temperature data was used, and we corrected only the GSWP3 precipitation. Deviations between CTRL and BIASED-COLD
reflect biased air temperature’s effects on responses across the thaw gradient. In the third set of simulations, BIASED-WET, we bias-corrected the air temperature extracted from GSWP3, which allows us to quantify the effects of biased precipitation. Finally, we used the meteorological conditions directly extracted from GSWP3 to drive our fourth set of simulations, BIASED-COLD&BIASED-WET, which reveals the uncertainty range of subarctic peatland simulation associated with the local biases in GSWP3 climate forcing.

While the three peatland types share the same climate conditions, they differ in soil hydrologic conditions and vegetation characteristics (section 2.1). The bulk density and porosity profiles were set to the values reported in Rydén et al. (1980), who suggested a decreasing trend of bulk density and an increasing trend of porosity from palsa (0.12 Mgm$^{-3}$ at surface; 92–93% within the upper 10 cm) to bog and fen (0.06 Mgm$^{-3}$ at surface; 96–97% within the upper 10 cm). The peatland soil carbon-to-nitrogen (C/N) ratios and pH values were assigned according to Hodgkins et al. (2014), who documented an increasing trend of pH from palsa (4.0), to bog (4.2), to fen (5.7), and a decreasing trend of soil organic matter C/N ratio from bog (46±18), to palsa (39±24), to fen (19±0.4). Common values of field capacity (0.4) and wilting point (0.15) were used for the three peatland types (Deng et al., 2014).

### 3 Results and Discussion

#### 3.1 GSWP3 climate comparison to observations

As described in section 2.3, we extracted meteorological conditions at the Stordalen Mire from the GSWP3 climate reanalysis dataset. The closest GSWP3 grid cell was centered at 68.0 °N and 19.0 °E, which covers the Stordalen Mire and the ANS. The
annual mean air temperature and precipitation calculated at this GSWP3 grid cell were -3.65 °C and 683.88 mm y⁻¹, respectively, for years 1913 to 2010. A cold bias (-3.09 °C) was identified in the GSWP3 annual mean air temperature during the 1913 to 2010 period, although a very high correlation coefficient (r = 0.99) was found when compared with the ANS measurements (Figure 1a). Both time series exhibit an overall warming trend from the early 20th century to the present (0.01 °C y⁻¹), with an even more prominent warming trend from 1980 to 2010 (0.05 °C y⁻¹ [ANS] and 0.04 °C y⁻¹ [GSWP3]).

Similarly, the GSWP3 annual total precipitation data correlates well with ANS measurements (r = 0.80) but has a wet bias of 380 mm y⁻¹ between 1913 and 2010 (Figure 1b). An increasing trend in annual total precipitation was recorded in both time series from the early 20th century to present (0.47 mm y⁻² [ANS] and 1.07 mm y⁻² [GSWP3]), although a decreasing trend was found from 1980 to 2010 (-0.56 mm y⁻² [ANS] and -2.39 mm y⁻² [GSWP3]).

The seasonal cycle of the GSWP3 monthly mean air temperature also matches that measured at the ANS, with a very high correlation coefficient (r = 0.99; Figure 2a). The underestimation bias and inter-annual variability of GSWP3 air temperature are greater in winter (maximum underestimate in December, at -4.52 °C) and smaller in summer (minimum underestimate in July, at -1.52 °C), respectively.

The magnitude and inter-annual variability of the GSWP3 monthly mean precipitation extracted from GSWP3 and the ANS measurements are comparable between winter and summer, while the ANS measurements exhibit stronger seasonality with lower magnitudes during winter. Despite the differences found in seasonal patterns, a high correlation coefficient (r = 0.64) was found between the monthly mean precipitation extracted from GSWP3 and the ANS measurements. The
overestimation of monthly mean precipitation was greatest in December (43.25 mm month⁻¹) and smallest in August (18.75 mm month⁻¹).

These comparisons suggest that GSPW3 air temperature and precipitation data reasonably capture measured seasonal and long-term trends over past decades, but are biased cold and wet compared to observations, especially during winter. Similar cold and wet biases exist in CRUNCEP and ECMWF climate reanalysis datasets during our 2003 to 2007 study period (Supplemental Material Figure 1). The calculated annual mean air temperature and precipitation at the Stordalen Mire for years 2003 to 2007 were -2.49 °C (precipitation 795.09 mm y⁻¹), -2.46 °C (708.60 mm y⁻¹), and -2.28 °C (765.67 mm y⁻¹) in the GSWP3, CRUNCEP, and ECMWF climate reanalysis datasets, respectively.

3.2 Model testing

3.2.1 Thaw depth

We first evaluated ecosys against observations using bias-corrected climate forcing (i.e., the CTRL simulation). Predicted thaw depth agrees well with measurements collected from 2003 to 2007 for all examined peatland types (Figure 3), with a correlation coefficient of 0.95, 0.87, and 0.41 at the palsa, bog, and fen, respectively. Both simulations and observations show that the rate of thaw depth deepening in the summer varies with peatland type (i.e., relatively slow, moderate, and rapid at the palsa, bog, and fen sites, respectively). Predicted and observed maximum thaw depth (i.e., Active Layer Depth, ALD) in the intact permafrost palsa was between 45 and 60 cm in September. In the partly thawed bog, the simulated thaw depth is slightly shallower than that observed before August. The
simulated bog thaw depth becomes greater than 90 cm by the end of August, which matches the time when measured thaw depth reaches its maximum. The thaw depth becomes greater than 90 cm by the end of July in the fully thawed fen. The patterns of thawing permafrost presented here are consistent with Deng et al. (2014), who simulated the same site using the DNDC model.

3.2.2 CO$_2$ exchanges

The daily Net Ecosystem Exchange (NEE) simulated in the CTRL simulation reasonably captures observed seasonal dynamics from 2003 to 2007 for all the examined peatland types (Figure 4). The simulations and observations showed net CO$_2$ uptake during summer and release during winter. The observations and simulations also showed large CO$_2$ emissions in the palsa site during Fall of 2004. Simulated Fall CO$_2$ bursts in the three sites in other years could not be confirmed because of a lack of observations during these periods. Similar to the patterns reported in Raz-Yaseef et al. (2016), some episodic CO$_2$ emission pulses were simulated as surface ice thaws in Spring, but there were no measurements to confirm those events. The correlation coefficients of the simulated and observed daily NEE ranged from 0.58 to 0.60, and most of the discrepancies between the simulations and observations were within the ranges of NEE variability measured at different subsites within the same peatland type.

As described in section 2.2, simulated CO$_2$ exchanges were evaluated for 3-hourly and daily time steps when quality-controlled measurements were available ($R^2$ values and relative root mean squared errors (RRMSEs) shown in Table 2). Simulated NEE is in reasonable agreement with the 3-hourly NEE measurements with RRMSEs ranging
from 8.4 to 19.1%. Model performance was generally poorer at daily time steps, although the calculated RRMSEs were comparable to those reported in Deng et al. (2014). We suspect this degradation resulted from uncertainty in determining a daily NEE representative of the entire peatland type due to (1) limited daily data points (less than 14% across the study period, Table 1) due to lack of continuous quality-controlled 3-hourly measurements and (2) the large variability of daily NEE ranges measured at different subsites within the same peatland type (Figure 4). Our results thus indicate that NEE is affected by thaw stage (Bäckstrand et al., 2010; Deng et al., 2014) and fine scale spatial heterogeneity of the system. More detailed measurements with higher spatial and temporal resolutions within the same peatland type would be necessary to characterize the effects of this type of heterogeneity.

3.2.3 Water table depth and \( \text{CH}_4 \) exchanges

Simulated water table depth generally captures observed seasonal patterns measured in the bog and fen sites from 2003 to 2007 (Figure 5a, c). During summer, the predicted bog water table depth fluctuates around the ground surface, and the predicted water table depth is at or above the ground surface in the fen. Water table depths simulated by ecosys are generally higher than the corresponding measurements in the bog, where measured water table depths are often below the ground surface with greater seasonal variability. Simulated fen water table depths have better overall fit to observations, being higher (~5 cm) than measurements in 2003 and 2004, close to measurements in 2005 and 2006, and slightly deeper (~2 cm) than measurements in 2007. The discrepancies in water table depth could be driven by the limitations of our one-
dimensional column simulation which inhibits lateral water transport and hinders the variations of water table depth, which is a particular issue in simulating the dynamic water table of the bog. A multi-dimensional simulation that includes realistic topographic effects could help improve the representation of water table dynamics, and estimates of the measurement uncertainty would help facilitate the assessment of simulation bias.

Simulated and measured daily CH$_4$ exchanges correlate reasonably well in the bog (r = 0.49) and well in the fen (r = 0.65) sites across the study period (Figure 5b, d). Both the simulations and observations have stronger CH$_4$ emissions during summer with peak emissions in late summer. Some episodic CH$_4$ emission pulses (Mastepanov et al., 2008) were simulated during shoulder seasons, and the simulated amount of post-growing season CH$_4$ emissions agrees well with those measured in 2007.

Most of the discrepancies between simulated and observed CH$_4$ emissions were within the variability of measurements across subsites within the same peatland type. The 3-hourly and daily RRMSEs ranged from 11.1 to 22.3% (Table 2) and the daily RRMSEs were comparable to results presented in Deng et al. (2014). Our results show that model evaluation of CH$_4$ emissions with finer temporal resolution observations is not necessarily superior to evaluation with coarser temporal resolution. This result could be related to weaker CH$_4$ emission variability measured across subsites within the same peatland type (Figure 5b, d).

3.3 Variability across the permafrost thaw gradient

Thaw rate and ALD increase along the thaw gradient (i.e., palsa to bog to fen), and landscape variations are generally greater than simulated inter-annual variability.
Maximum carbon uptake also increases along the thaw gradient, and variations across the landscape are comparable with simulated intra-seasonal and inter-annual variabilities (Figure 6b). The simulated mean seasonal cumulative NEE were calculated based on the seasonality identified in Bäckstrand et al. (2010), and the results show that the magnitude of mean growing season CO$_2$ uptake is highest in the fen and lowest in the palsa (Table 3). The same rank applies to the magnitude of mean CO$_2$ emissions over the non-growing season, although differences across the thaw gradient are smaller.

CH$_4$ emission rates increase significantly along the thaw gradient, and the palsa site emissions are negligible (Figure 6c). Mean cumulative CH$_4$ emissions simulated in the fen site are much higher than those in the bog site, and most CH$_4$ emissions occur during the growing season (Table 3). The higher CH$_4$ emissions in the fully thawed fen can be attributed to its faster thaw rate (Figure 6a) and a water table depth close to the surface (Figure 5c). Seasonal cumulative NEE and CH$_4$ emissions from observations could not be accessed due to the lack of continuous quality controlled carbon flux measurements during our study period (Table 1).

4. Climate sensitivity of permafrost thaw

4.1 Thaw responses to climate

For each of the four sets of simulations with different climate forcing (section 2.5), simulated mean ALD from 2003 to 2007 is always greatest in the fen and lowest in the palsa (Figure 7). This consistent trend along the thaw gradient indicates that ALDs are largely regulated by their distinct ecological and hydrological conditions, because all
three sites had the same climate forcing in each set of simulations (i.e., CTRL, BIASED-COLD, BIASED-WET, and BIASED-COLD&BIASED-WET). Therefore, the intact permafrost palsa, partly thawed bog, and fully thawed fen have different resilience against the changes in climate forcing, and this type of ecosystem resilience plays an important role in determining ALD under changes in climate conditions.

Effects of climate on simulated ALD are similar across peatland types (Figure 7). With increased precipitation (BIASED-WET vs. CTRL), simulated ALD generally becomes deeper with greater inter-annual variability at all the examined peatland types. This effect is less prominent in the comparison between experiments BIASED-COLD and BIASED-COLD&BIASED-WET, possibly because the cold biases in these two experiments (section 3.1) constrain ALD variation. The simulated ALD also becomes deeper with higher air temperature (CTRL vs. BIASED-COLD; BIASED-WET vs. BIASED-COLD&BIASED-WET) at all the examined peatland types. This response is more evident in the comparison between experiments BIASED-WET and BIASED-COLD&BIASED-WET, probably driven by their wet bias (section 3.1) that facilities ALD deepening (via increased thermal conductivity and advective heat transport; Grant et al. 2017a). Similar dependencies between ALD and climate were shown in Åkerman and Johansson (2008) and Johansson et al. (2013), based on multi-year measurements and snow manipulation experiments.

Therefore, the combined cold and wet biases in the GSWP3 climate reanalysis dataset could counteract their individual effects on simulated ALD development at the Stordalen Mire. Our results indicate a 28.6%, 0.7%, and 11.7% underestimation of ALD simulated in the palsa, bog, and fen sites, respectively, when applying the GSWP3
climate reanalysis data over this region without proper bias correction (BIASED-COLD & BIASED-WET vs. CTRL). Our sensitivity analysis suggests that projected warming and wetting trends (Collins et al., 2013) could significantly increase ALD in the Arctic, since increases in precipitation and air temperature can both contribute to ALD deepening.

4.2 Carbon budget responses to climate

Annual mean (from 2003 to 2007) CO₂ and CH₄ exchanges simulated with the four climate forcing datasets (section 2.5) indicate a general CO₂ sink and CH₄ source, except the weak CO₂ emissions simulated at the fen in experiment BIASED-COLD & BIASED-WET (Figure 8a,b). Our results also indicate that differences in annual CO₂ and CH₄ exchanges across the four climate forcing datasets for a single peatland type are as large as those across peatland types for a single climate forcing dataset (Figure 8a,b). These large CO₂ and CH₄ exchanges climate sensitivities demonstrate that the peatland’s dynamical responses to climate have stronger effects on the carbon cycle than on ALDs (Figure 7).

With bias-corrected precipitation, increased air temperature (CTRL vs. BIASED-COLD) leads to stronger CO₂ uptake and greater CH₄ emissions at all the examined peatland types (Figure 8a,b), mainly because enhanced sedge growth facilitates carbon cycling under a warmer environment (results not shown). This air temperature sensitivity affects CO₂ and CH₄ exchanges within the same peatland type without significantly changing ALD (Figure 7). For both experiments, CO₂ uptake and CH₄ emissions are greatest in the fully thawed fen and lowest in the intact permafrost palsa, consistent with
the measurements reported in Bäckstrand et al. (2010) for the same period. Based on the Coupled Model Intercomparison Project, phase 5 (CMIP5) ESM simulations, arctic annual mean surface air temperature is projected to increase by $8.5 \pm 2.1$ °C over the 21st century (Bintanja and Andry, 2017). This projected air temperature increase is more than double the air temperature difference between site-observed and GSWP3 temperatures, which could significantly enhance CH$_4$ emissions regardless of palsa degradation into bog and fen.

On the other hand, wet biases (BIASED-WET and BIASED-COLD&BIASED-WET) increase CH$_4$ emissions in the palsa site; wetter and colder conditions result in as much CH$_4$ release as the current fen sites, while wetter conditions alone drive palsa emissions comparable to the current bog sites (Figure 8b). The large precipitation sensitivity found in palsa CH$_4$ emissions could have strong effects on palsa carbon cycling because arctic precipitation is projected to increase by 50 – 60% towards the end of the twenty-first century (based on CMIP5 estimates; Bintanja and Andry, 2017). The comparison between experiments BIASED-WET and BIASED-COLD&BIASED-WET shows that in the palsa, increased air temperature strengthens CO$_2$ uptake and weakens CH$_4$ emissions. This shift is primarily driven in the model by increased shrub and moss productivity under the warmer environment, which facilitate CO$_2$ uptake while drying out the soil and reducing CH$_4$ emissions (results not shown). In the bog and fen sites, increased air temperature under wet bias strengthens both the simulated CO$_2$ uptake and CH$_4$ emissions (BIASED-WET vs. BIASED-COLD&BIASED-WET), due to enhanced sedge growth under the warmer environment that facilitates carbon cycling in the experiment BIASED-WET.
We assessed the integrated effects of the changes in CO$_2$ and CH$_4$ exchanges identified in the full suite of simulations in terms of the Net Carbon Balance (NCB) and net emissions of greenhouse gases expressed as CO$_2$ equivalents (Net Greenhouse Gas Balance; NGGB). NCB was defined as the sum of the annual total CO$_2$ and CH$_4$ exchanges. NGGB was defined in a similar fashion as the NCB, but considers the greater radiative forcing potential of CH$_4$ than CO$_2$ (28 times over a 100-year horizon, Myhre et al., 2013) when calculating the annual total. The calculated NCB values are mostly negative because the stronger CO$_2$ uptake dominates the weaker CH$_4$ emissions (Figure 8c). The results suggest that all the examined peatland types serve as net carbon sinks under current climate (CTRL), consistent with the estimates reported in Deng et al. (2014) and Lundin et al. (2016). We find a 24, 36, and 38 g C m$^{-2}$ y$^{-1}$ underestimation of NCB simulated in the palsa, bog, and fen sites, respectively, due to the cold and wet biases in the GSWP3 climate reanalysis dataset (BIASED-COLD&BIASED-WET vs. CTRL). NGGB is affected more strongly by CH$_4$ emissions (Figure 8d), due to its larger radiative forcing potential. NGGB values are positive over the bog and fen sites, suggesting that these sites can exhibit positive radiative forcing impacts despite being net carbon sinks. NGGB simulated in the palsa site is generally negative (i.e., a net sink from the atmosphere) due to lower CH$_4$ emissions, except for the simulation conducted without any climate bias correction (correcting only air temperature increased CH$_4$ emissions but not enough to compensate for the significantly higher CO$_2$ sink). Our results indicate that the simulated NGGB would be biased by 298, -66, and -252 g CO$_2$-eq m$^{-2}$ y$^{-1}$ in the palsa, bog, and fen sites, respectively, without proper bias correction for the GSWEP3 climate reanalysis dataset (BIASED-COLD&BIASED-WET vs. CTRL). Using the GSWEP3
products directly thus effectively eliminates the positive radiative forcing from the expanding bog and fen sites, while creating a potentially dramatically inaccurate positive radiative forcing from the shrinking palsa sites.

**4.3 Climate sensitivity versus landscape heterogeneity**

Climate sensitivity and landscape heterogeneity are defined here as variability across the four climate forcing datasets for a single peatland type, and variability across three peatland types with bias-corrected climate (CTRL), respectively. We estimated carbon cycle variability associated with climate sensitivity and landscape heterogeneity to quantify the corresponding uncertainty in our annual carbon cycle assessments from 2003 to 2007. Our results indicate that differences in simulated annual mean CO$_2$ exchanges and NCB from climate sensitivity are greater than those from landscape heterogeneity (Figure 8a,c); i.e., annual CO$_2$ uptake strength is more sensitive to climate forcing uncertainty than to peatland type representation. In terms of the simulated annual mean CH$_4$ emissions and NGGB, our results indicate that variability from climate sensitivity is comparable to those from landscape heterogeneity (Figure 8b,d). Therefore, bias-corrected climate and realistic peatland characterization are both necessary to reduce the uncertainty in representing CH$_4$ dynamics and its radiative forcing effects.

In addition to its effects on carbon cycle predictions, changes in climate conditions also affect permafrost degradation and thus induce changes in areal cover of peatland types. Malmer et al. (2005) showed that there were -0.95, 0.24, and 0.62 ha areal cover changes (-10.3%, 4.0%, and 46.3% percentage changes) from 1970 to 2000 in palsa, bog, and fen, respectively, at the Stordalen Mire. By applying the annual mean
CO₂ and CH₄ exchanges simulated with bias-corrected climate from 2003 to 2007, the areal cover changes from 1970 to 2000 alone would lead to -44 kg C y⁻¹, 76 kg C y⁻¹, and 2076 kg CO₂-eq y⁻¹ changes in annual mean CO₂ exchanges, CH₄ exchanges, and NGGB, respectively, at the Stordalen Mire. The changes in landscape scale carbon cycle dynamics indicate that the radiative warming impact of increased CH₄ emissions is large enough to offsets the radiative cooling impact of increased CO₂ uptake at the Stordalen Mire, consistent with the estimates reported in Deng et al. (2014). The areal cover changes across peatland types could persist or accelerate under the projected warming and wetting trends in the Arctic (Collins et al., 2013; Bintanja and Andry, 2017), which could stimulate CH₄ emissions and produce a stronger radiative warming impact.

5. Conclusions

We evaluated the climate bias in a widely used atmospheric reanalysis product (GSWP3) at our northern Sweden Stordalen Mire site. We then applied a comprehensive biogeochemistry model, ecosys, to estimate the effects of these biases on active layer development and carbon cycling across a thaw gradient at the site. Our results show that ecosys reasonably represented measured hydrological, thermal, and biogeochemical cycle processes in the intact permafrost palsa, partly thawed bog, and fully thawed fen. We found that the cold and wet biases in the GSWP3 climate reanalysis dataset significantly alter model simulations, leading to biases in simulated Active Layer Depths, Net Carbon Balance, and Net Greenhouse Gas Balance by up to 28.6%, 38 g C m⁻² y⁻¹, and 298 g CO₂-eq m⁻² y⁻¹, respectively. The Net Carbon Balance simulated with bias-corrected climate suggests that all the examined peatland types are currently net carbon sinks from
the atmosphere, although the bog and fen sites can have positive radiative forcing impacts
due to their higher CH$_4$ emissions.

Our results indicate that the annual means of ALD, CO$_2$ uptake, and CH$_4$
emissions generally increase along the permafrost thaw gradient at the Stordalen Mire
under current climate, consistent with previous studies in this region. Our analysis
suggests that palsa, bog, and fen landscape features differ strongly in their carbon cycling
dynamics and have different responses to climate forcing biases. Differences in simulated
CO$_2$ and CH$_4$ exchanges driven by uncertainty from climate forcing are as large as those
from landscape heterogeneity across the examined permafrost thaw gradient. Model
simulations demonstrate that the palsa site exhibits the strongest sensitivity to biases in
air temperature and precipitation. The wet bias in GSWP3 could erroneously increase
predicted CH$_4$ emissions from the palsa site to a magnitude comparable to emissions
currently measured in bog and fen sites. These results also show that increased
precipitation projected for high latitude regions could strongly accelerate CH$_4$ emissions
from the palsa area, even without degradation of palsa into bog and fen. Future studies
should thus recognize the effects of climate forcing uncertainty on carbon cycling, in
addition to tracking changes in carbon budget associated with areal changes in permafrost
degradation.

Acknowledgements

This study was funded by the Genomic Science Program of the United States Department
of Energy Office of Biological and Environmental Research under the ISOGENIE
project, grant DE-SC0016440, to Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory under contract DE-
AC02-05CH11231, and by support from the Swedish Research Council (VR) to PMC.

We thank the Abisko Scientific Research Station of the Swedish Polar Research Secretariat for providing the meteorological data.
References


Grant, R. F.: Modelling changes in nitrogen cycling to sustain increases in forest productivity under elevated atmospheric CO2 and contrasting site conditions, Biogeosciences, 10(11), 7703–7721, doi:10.5194/bg-10-7703-2013, 2013.


Grant, R. F., Black, T. A., Humphreys, E. R. and Morgenstern, K.: Changes in net ecosystem productivity with forest age following clearcutting of a coastal
Douglas-fir forest: testing a mathematical model with eddy covariance measurements along a forest chronosequence, Tree Physiol., 27(1), 115–131, 2007a.


Raz-Yaseef, N., Torn, M. S., Wu, Y., Billesbach, D. P., Liljedahl, A. K., Kneafsey, T. J., Romanovsky, V. E., Cook, D. R. and Wullschleger, S. D.: Large CO2 and CH4 emissions from polygonal tundra during spring thaw in northern Alaska,


864 Viovy N.: CRUNCEP Version 7 - Atmospheric Forcing Data for the Community Land Model, Research Data Archive at the National Center for Atmospheric Research, Computational and Information Systems Laboratory, Boulder CO.


Table 1. Temporal coverage of quality-controlled CO$_2$ and CH$_4$ exchanges measured by automatic chambers at the three peatland types in the Stordalen Mire during the years 2002 to 2007.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sites</th>
<th>Number of data points</th>
<th>3 Hourly coverage (%)</th>
<th>Daily coverage (%)</th>
<th>Number of data points</th>
<th>3 Hourly coverage (%)</th>
<th>Daily coverage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Palsa</td>
<td>12752</td>
<td>65.8</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bog</td>
<td>12821</td>
<td>68.5</td>
<td>12.7</td>
<td>6660</td>
<td>96.2</td>
<td>25.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fen</td>
<td>8989</td>
<td>63.8</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td>4923</td>
<td>90.5</td>
<td>33.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. The evaluation of the 3 hourly and daily CO$_2$ and CH$_4$ exchanges simulated at the palsa, bog, and fen sites. RRMSEs are relative root mean squared errors.

| Sites | C component | 3-Hourly | | Daily | | |
|-------|-------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|----------------|
|       |             | $R^2$ | RRMSEs (%) | $R^2$ | RRMSEs (%) |
| Palsa | CO$_2$      | 0.48 | 13.4 | 0.36 | 18.3 |
|        |            |      |       |      |      |
| Bog    | CO$_2$      | 0.63 | 19.1 | 0.44 | 35.8 |
|        | CH$_4$     | 0.31 | 16.3 | 0.47 | 22.3 |
| Fen    | CO$_2$      | 0.64 | 8.4  | 0.43 | 25.5 |
|        | CH$_4$     | 0.44 | 11.1 | 0.54 | 16.9 |
Table 3. Means and standard deviations of cumulative $\text{CO}_2$ and $\text{CH}_4$ exchanges simulated at the palsa, bog, and fen sites during the period 2003 to 2007. All units are represented in g C m$^{-2}$.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sites</th>
<th>C flux component</th>
<th>Growing season; Days 119–288</th>
<th>Non-growing season; Days 1–118/289–365</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>Standard deviation</td>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Palsa</td>
<td>$\text{CO}_2$</td>
<td>-72.70</td>
<td>19.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\text{CH}_4$</td>
<td>0.04</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bog</td>
<td>$\text{CO}_2$</td>
<td>-79.59</td>
<td>21.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\text{CH}_4$</td>
<td>3.52</td>
<td>0.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fen</td>
<td>$\text{CO}_2$</td>
<td>-88.65</td>
<td>7.26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$\text{CH}_4$</td>
<td>10.86</td>
<td>3.95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 1. Time series of the air temperature (a) and precipitation (b) measured at ANS (red; years 1913–2016) and extracted from GSWP3 (blue; years 1901–2010). Dots are the annual means and solid lines are the decadal moving averages of the corresponding annual means. Thin and thick dashed lines are the trends for years 1913–2010, and years 1980–2010, respectively. The inset r values are the correlation coefficients calculated between the two time series.
Figure 2. Monthly mean air temperature (a) and precipitation (b) measured at ANS (red) and extracted from GSWP3 (blue). The shaded area is the inter-annual variability for the corresponding dataset, represented by the standard deviations calculated at each month. The inset r values are the correlation coefficients calculated between the two time series.
Figure 3. Simulated (solid lines) and measured (open circles) seasonal dynamics of thaw depth at the palsa (a), bog (b), and fen (c) sites from 2003 to 2007. Downward arrows indicate the time period that the measured thaw depth is deeper than 90 cm for a measurement year.
Figure 4. Simulated (solid lines) and measured (open circles) daily CO$_2$ exchanges (NEE) at the palsa (a), bog (b), and fen (c) sites, from 2003 to 2007. Shaded bars are the standard deviations of the daily NEE measured across the subsites under each peatland type. The positive values indicate effluxes, and the negative values indicate influxes.
Figure 5. Simulated (solid lines) and measured (open circles) water table depth and daily \n\n\nCH\textsubscript{4} emissions at the bog and fen sites from 2003 to 2007. Shaded bars are the standard \n\ndeviations of the daily \n\n\nCH\textsubscript{4} emissions measured across the subsites under each peatland \n\n\ntype.
Figure 6. Daily composite results of (a) thaw depth, (b) daily NEE, and (c) daily CH$_4$ exchanges across the thaw gradient from 2003 to 2007. Solid lines and open circles are the simulated and measured inter-annual means, respectively. The shaded area is the simulated inter-annual variability for the corresponding dataset, represented by the standard deviations calculated at each day of year. The positive values indicate effluxes, and the negative values indicate influxes.
Figure 7. Simulated ALD at the palsa, bog, and fen sites, for four sets of climate forcing (Section 2.5). Bars and error bars are the means and standard deviations calculated from 2003 to 2007, respectively.
Figure 8. Annual CO$_2$ exchanges (a), CH$_4$ exchanges (b), Net Carbon Balance (c), and Net Greenhouse Gas Balance (d) simulated at the palsa, bog, and fen sites, under each set of simulations. Bars and error bars are the means and standard deviations calculated from 2003 to 2007, respectively. The positive values indicate effluxes, and the negative values indicate influxes.